

neither Reid nor Paterson provide any explicit suggestions that recognise the key factor that will determine the outcome of the ACHAs. This is the policy gridlock that any federal system almost inevitably imposes.

A recent issue of the *Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law* was devoted to health politics and policy in a federal system. The editor, Petersen, concludes with a view relevant to Australia: "You can love it, you can hate it, but ... federalism thwarts uniformity and universalism, frustrates responsiveness and policy analysis, limits large scale innovation while churning more localized mills of idea generation and promotion, and offers a permanent employment plan for health policy researchers".³

Parts of Australian health arrangements certainly need an overhaul. An example is general practice. This sector, differently organised and financed, could deliver much more to the community, the rest of the healthcare system, the Federal Government and to general practitioners themselves. Change in this sector would not depend on improbable cooperation between levels of government, and would be more manageable than the multifarious whole-of-system reforms about which Reid and Paterson speculate.

1. Reid MA. Reform of the Australian Health Care Agreements: progress or political ploy? *Med J Aust* 2002; 177: 310-312.
2. Paterson JP. Australian Health Care Agreements 2003-2008: a new dawn? *Med J Aust* 2002; 177: 313-315.
3. Petersen MA. Health politics and policy in a federal system. *J Health Politics Policy Law* 2001; 26 (6): 1222. □

Pertussis: adults as a source in healthcare settings

R John Massie,* Sultan Altunaji,†
Renata Kukurozovic,‡ Nigel Curtis§

*Respiratory Physician; †Master of Medicine Student; ‡Gastroenterologist; §Head, Paediatric Infectious Diseases Unit; Royal Children's Hospital, Parkville, VIC 3052.
massiej@cryptic.rch.unimelb.edu.au

TO THE EDITOR: In their article describing an outbreak of *Bordetella pertussis* infection, Spearing and colleagues report an adult contact who was infected with *B. pertussis* and was treated with roxithromycin.¹ In our experience, this is common practice in Australia, where roxithromycin is a frequently used macrolide antibiotic.

We are currently preparing a systematic review (registered with the Cochrane acute infections group) of the effectiveness of antibiotic therapy for treating pertussis. We have found no studies of the effectiveness of roxithromycin for either treatment or contact prophylaxis for pertussis infection. *B. pertussis* is sensitive *in vitro* to roxithromycin but 2-4-fold less so than to erythromycin.

While relying on the class effect of macrolides in eradicating *B. pertussis* and using roxithromycin in preference to erythromycin because of its lower side-effect profile may seem logical, there is no evidence to support this practice. In contrast, there is at least one study showing the efficacy of clarithromycin as an alternative to erythromycin for the treatment of pertussis.²

1. Spearing NM, Horvath RL, McCormack JG. Pertussis: adults as a source in healthcare settings. *Med J Aust* 2002; 177: 568-569.
2. Lebel MH, Mehra S. Efficacy and safety of clarithromycin versus erythromycin for the treatment of pertussis: a prospective, randomized, single blind trial. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 2001; 1149-1154. □

Joseph G McCormack,* Natalie M Spearing,†
Robert L Horvath‡

*Director of Infectious Diseases, Mater Misericordiae Health Services, Raymond Terrace, South Brisbane, QLD 4101; †Clinical Nurse Consultant, Department of Infection Control, Faculty of Health Sciences, University of Queensland, Herston, QLD; ‡Microbiology Registrar Advanced Trainee in Infectious Diseases, Canberra Hospital, Garran, ACT.
jmccorma@mater.org.au

IN REPLY: As we mentioned in our article, erythromycin is the drug of choice for treatment and prophylaxis of pertussis in people of all ages.¹ Several statements can be made about the use of macrolides in this condition.²

Firstly, erythromycin has been shown to decrease the duration of illness when given early in pertussis infection and to eliminate *Bordetella pertussis* from the nasopharynx.

Secondly, erythromycin therapy for index cases has been shown to reduce the rate of secondary cases of pertussis in households in uncontrolled studies.³ However, in a recent randomised placebo-controlled study, while erythromycin reduced the incidence of culture-positive pertussis in household contacts there was no reduction in respiratory symptoms.⁴

Thirdly, clarithromycin and azithromycin have been shown to be at least as effective as erythromycin in treating pertussis in two small comparative studies.⁵

As Massie et al point out, there are no clinical studies of the use of roxithromycin in this condition, and laboratory *in vitro* sensitivity studies suggest roxithromycin may be inferior to erythromycin.

Roxithromycin is the most widely used macrolide in Australia, but it requires a leap of faith and extrapolation to prescribe this drug for prophylaxis or treatment of pertussis. In the one case in our series where roxithromycin was prescribed, this was not our decision. We would have recommended erythromycin on the basis of the available clinical evidence.

Vaccination is preferable to antibiotic prophylaxis for long-term control of pertussis.

1. Spearing NM, Horvath RL, McCormack JG. Pertussis: adults as a source in healthcare settings. *Med J Aust* 2002; 177: 568-569.
2. Weber DJ, Rutala WA. Pertussis: a continuing hazard for healthcare facilities. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol* 2001; 22: 736-740.
3. Wirsing von Konig CH, Postels-Multani S, Bock HL, Schmitt HL. Pertussis in adults: frequency of transmission after household exposure. *Lancet* 1995; 346: 1326-1329.
4. Halperin SA, Bortolussi R, Langley JL, et al. A randomised placebo-controlled trial of erythromycin estolate chemoprophylaxis for household contacts of children with culture-positive *Bordetella pertussis* infection. *Pediatrics* 1999; 104: e42.
5. Aoyama T, Sunakawa K, Iwata S, et al. Efficacy of short-term treatment of pertussis with clarithromycin and azithromycin. *J Pediatrics* 1996; 129: 761-764. □

Boundaries of medicine

Grant M Russell

General Practitioner, 9 Crosby Street, Floreat, WA 6014. russellg@cylle.uwa.edu.au

TO THE EDITOR: Van Der Weyden has asked a provocative question about the relevance of what he calls "medicine's homage to health".¹ In so doing, he pays his own homage to a world where boundaries are sharp and healing becomes reduced to a matter of applying "bioscience to matters of mind and body".

While I daresay many editors of biomedical journals would share his view, he is only highlighting an age-old tension. Indeed, Crookshank wrote in 1926 about the Ancient Greek schools of Cos and Cnidus, and of their debate about doctrines of the natural/descriptive and the conventional/aca-