

Finally, the study did not assess stress, which may constitute a further, important uncontrolled bias. A recent cohort study of stress and the common cold concluded that all four dimensions of stress investigated — stressful life events, negative affects, positive affects and perceived stress — were significantly related to occurrence of the common cold.<sup>7</sup> Stress may also have significantly affected symptom severity and participants' perception of their symptoms.

Certainly, the trend observed in the placebo group of shorter duration of some symptoms and lower mean severity could have been due to less severe symptom history, compounded by a lower degree of overall stress.

1. Douglas RM, Chalker EB, Treacy B. Vitamin C for preventing and treating the common cold. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2000; 2: CD000980.
2. Audera C, Patulny RV, Sander BH, Douglas RM. Mega-dose vitamin C in treatment of the common cold: a randomised controlled trial. *Med J Aust* 2001; 175: 359-362.
3. Smith A, Tyrrell D, Coyle K, et al. Diurnal variation in the symptoms of colds and influenza. *Chronobiol Int* 1988; 5: 411-416.
4. Cohen S, Tyrrell DA, Russell MA, et al. Smoking, alcohol consumption, and susceptibility to the common cold. *Am J Public Health* 1993; 83: 1277-1283.
5. Pamuk E, Byers T, Coates R, et al. Effect of smoking on serum nutrient concentrations in African-American women. *Am J Clin Nutr* 1994; 59: 891-895.
6. Kleszczewski T, Kleszczewska E. FIA of vitamin C in blood serum in humans at increasing ethanol concentration. *J Pharm Biomed Anal* 2001; 25: 477-481.
7. Takkouche B, Regueira C, Gestal-Otero JJ. A cohort study of stress and the common cold. *Epidemiology* 2001; 12: 345-349. □

**Carmen Audera,\* Roger V Patulny,†  
Beate H Sander,‡ Robert M Douglas§**

\*Lecturer; †Research Assistant; ‡Research Assistant; §Visiting Fellow (corresponding author), National Centre for Epidemiology and Population Health, Australian National University, GPO Box 4, Canberra, ACT 2601. bob.douglas@anu.edu.au

**IN REPLY:** Precisely because of the temporal variation in symptom severity described by Vitetta and colleagues, we judged that medical professionals are not as well able, in a variably timed interview, to quantify patients' cold symptoms as the patients themselves can do on a continuing basis. Therefore, we consider that our study<sup>1</sup> would have been no more valid if the detailed symptom severity cards had been supplemented by one or more physical examinations. In that respect, we are in good company with others who have studied the common cold over many years.<sup>2</sup>

We agree that double-blind randomisation does not necessarily distribute all relevant variables equally. That is why, in Box 2 of our study report, we presented four variables — age, sex, mean number of colds in the previous year, and mean number of days unwell with colds in the previous year.<sup>1</sup> The likelihood that stress,

smoking and alcohol status would have been sufficiently maldistributed in this large group to mask a significantly beneficial effect in even one of the three groups which received high-dose vitamin C seems vanishingly small. Nevertheless, we acknowledge that the study would have been stronger if we could have reported the distribution of these three potential confounders.

We contest the view of Vitetta and colleagues that the evidence from randomised controlled trials of vitamin C in treating the common cold conflicts significantly (see Box 1 of our article<sup>1</sup>). The overview finding — that mega-doses of vitamin C for prophylaxis produce a relatively trivial reduction in cold severity but no reduction in incidence<sup>3</sup> — was the stimulus for our own study. No community studies of this issue have been flawless, but the mounting collective evidence suggests that we should look elsewhere for a cold panacea.

1. Audera C, Patulny RV, Sander BH, Douglas RM. Mega-dose vitamin C in treatment of the common cold: a randomised controlled trial. *Med J Aust* 2001; 175: 359-362.
2. Tyrrell DJ, Craig JW, Meade TW, White TA. A trial of ascorbic acid in the treatment of the common cold. *Br J Prev Soc Med* 1977; 31: 189-191.
3. Douglas RM, Chalker EB, Treacy B. Vitamin C for preventing and treating the common cold (Cochrane Review). In: *The Cochrane Library* 3, 2001. Oxford: Update Software. □

## Evolving evidence and continuing uncertainties for eating disorders

**Janice D Russell,\* Suzanne F Abraham†**

\*Director, Eating Disorders Program, Northside Clinic, 2 Greenwich Road, Greenwich, NSW 2065, and Clinical Associate Professor, Department of Psychological Medicine, University of Sydney; †Codirector, Eating Disorders Program, and Associate Professor, Department of Reproductive Medicine, University of Sydney. jrussel1@mail.usyd.au

**TO THE EDITOR:** We are writing in response to the editorial of Ben-Tovim et al.<sup>1</sup> Although we agree that more research into treatment efficacy in eating disorders is needed, we believe that the study to which reference is made<sup>2</sup> is seriously flawed. The study should not be presumed to provide evidence about the effect of treatment on outcome, particularly as the majority of patients studied received no treatment. The high death rate (3/95 [3.2%] among patients with anorexia nervosa and 2/37 [5.4%] among patients with "eating disorders not otherwise specified") in such mildly ill patients (few of whom would have warranted hospitalisation on the basis of their weight) approximates that of seriously

emaciated patients in longer-term studies of treatment outcome<sup>3,4</sup> and could more properly be said to illustrate the results of having no treatment or inadequate treatment.

Exactly what constituted specialised treatment is never actually described in the original article,<sup>2</sup> in which "extended inpatient treatment" is defined as treatment lasting more than two weeks and "extended outpatient treatment" as three or more visits. Thus, the so-called "resource intensive treatment" the authors refer to would not necessarily represent even adequate management of these conditions.

In our own 6–10-year outcome study<sup>5,6</sup> cited by the authors, 61 emaciated patients with anorexia nervosa received, on average, 11 weeks of inpatient treatment consisting of nutritional rehabilitation and psychotherapy. Only one patient died (of suicide) and, of the patients fully assessed, 41/50 (82%) had a good or intermediate outcome. The degree of weight restoration achieved by the end of treatment correlated with the degree of osteoporosis 10 years later.<sup>7</sup>

In other studies, duration of illness and early intervention have been shown to significantly influence outcome.<sup>4</sup> This contrasts with the findings of Ben-Tovim et al,<sup>2</sup> which may have been skewed by an unusual level of chronicity in the study group. A recent study of 69 patients with eating disorders treated in our own multidisciplinary program showed that, on 12–18-month follow-up, 48/69 (70%) had improved and 34/69 (49%) no longer had an eating disorder diagnosis. Mean levels of all but one of the major behavioural and psychological features rated by the EEE-C (Eating and Exercise Examination by Computer) instrument<sup>8</sup> were significantly reduced.

The advice given by Ben-Tovim and colleagues to the parents of the hypothetical 15-year-old girl with anorexia nervosa is regrettably nihilistic and, if based on their *Lancet* study,<sup>2</sup> not founded on sound or generalisable evidence. Parents should be referred to a program for which good outcomes have been demonstrated, treatment accords with published guidelines, the clinicians are suitably experienced, and in which early intervention is the aim.<sup>4</sup>

1. Ben-Tovim DI, Gilchrist PN, Walker MK. Evolving evidence and continuing uncertainties for eating disorders [editorial]. *Med J Aust* 2001; 175: 238-239.
2. Ben-Tovim DI, Walker K, Gilchrist P, et al. Outcome of patients with eating disorders: a 5-year study. *Lancet* 2001; 357: 1254-1257.
3. Ratnisuriya RH, Eisler I, Szmukler GI, Russell GM. Anorexia nervosa: outcome and prognostic factors after 20 years. *Br J Psychiatry* 1991; 156: 495-502.

4. Zipfel S, Lowe B, Reas DL, et al. Long-term prognosis in anorexia nervosa: lessons from a 21-year follow-up study. *Lancet* 2000; 355: 721-722.
5. Gross G, Russell JD, Beumont PJV, et al. Longitudinal study of patients with anorexia nervosa 6 to 10 years after treatment. *Ann N Y Acad Sci* 2000; 904: 614-616.
6. Gross G. Longitudinal study of patients with anorexia nervosa 6 to 10 years after treatment [PhD dissertation]. Hamburg: Verlag Dr Kovacs, 2001.
7. Russell JD, Gross G. Anorexia nervosa and body mass index [letter]. *Am J Psychiatry* 2001; 157(12): 2060.
8. Abraham S, Lovell N. Eating and exercise examination by computer. Melbourne: Ashwood Medical, 1999. □

#### David I Ben-Tovim

Director, Clinical Epidemiology Unit, and Associate Professor of Psychiatry, Flinders Medical Centre, Bedford Park, SA.  
David.Ben-Tovim@fmc.sa.gov.au

**IN REPLY:** The commitment of Russell and Abraham to their own program has distracted them from accurate reporting and sound epidemiological principles. They say that the majority of patients that we studied received no treatment. Not so. We clearly stated that only 34 of the 220 patients studied received no treatment.<sup>1</sup> They then draw a range of inferences from the fact that "3/95 (3.2%)" patients with anorexia nervosa died. In fact, only 2 of 95 patients with anorexia nervosa died as a consequence of that disorder during the five years of our study. At 2.1%, this is similar to the crude death rate of 1/61 (1.6%) that they describe in their own study.

However, it is only acceptable to use a rare outcome as a measure of the efficacy of a treatment program if the clinical characteristics that put patients at risk for such an outcome are known and accounted for. We do not know the specific factors that put people at particular risk of dying from anorexia nervosa. Without such knowledge, small differences in crude death rates can not of themselves inform us whether treatment programs diminish or accentuate such risks. Unfortunately, there are no other studies against which to compare the outcomes of the patients with "eating disorders not otherwise specified" in our study. We have dealt with issues such as the representative nature of our study elsewhere.<sup>2</sup> I stand by our work and the conclusions we draw from it.

1. Ben-Tovim DI, Walker K, Gilchrist P, et al. Outcome of patients with eating disorders: a 5-year study. *Lancet* 2001; 357: 1254-1257.
2. Ben-Tovim DI, Esterman A. Outcome in anorexia nervosa [letter]. *Lancet* 2001; 358: 926. □

### MJA ADVERTISERS' INDEX

#### Schering Pty Limited

Betaferon . . . . . Inside front cover

Diane 35-ED . . . . . Inside back cover

Diane 35-ED prescribing information . . . . p299

Microgynon 20 . . . . . Outside back cover

## The Medical Journal MJA of Australia

#### Editor

Martin Van Der Weyden, MD, FRACP, FRCPA

#### Deputy Editors

Bronwyn Gaut, MB BS, DCH, DA

Ruth Armstrong, BMed

Mabel Chew, MB BS(Hons), FRACGP, FACHPM

#### Kincaid-Smith Editorial Fellow

Jenny Bergen, MB BS, FRANZCP

#### Manager, Communications Development

Craig Bingham, BA(Hons), DipEd

#### Senior Assistant Editor

Helen Randall, BSc, DipOT

#### Assistant Editors

Elsina Meyer, BSc

Kerrie Lawson, BSc(Hons), PhD, MASM

Tim Badgery-Parker, BSc(Hons)

Josephine Wall, BA, BAppSci, GradDipLib

#### Proof Reader

Richard Bellamy

#### Editorial Administrator

Kerrie Harding

#### Editorial Assistant

Christine Tsim

#### Production Manager

Glenn Carter

#### Editorial Production Assistant

Melissa Sherman

#### Librarian and Book Review Editor

Joanne Elliot, BA, GradDipLib

#### Consultant Biostatistician

Val Gebksi, BA, MStat

#### Content Review Committee

Mark Harris, MD, FRACGP

Adrian Mindel, MD, FRCP, FRACP

Michael Solomon, MB BCh(Hons), MSc, FRACS

John Wilson, MB BS, PhD, FRACP

Jeffrey Zajac, MB BS, PhD, FRACP

#### Editor Emeritus

Ronald R Winton, OAM, MB BS, FRACP

#### Australasian Medical Publishing Co Pty Ltd

#### Advertising & Business Development Manager

Peter Butterfield

#### Advertising Coordinator

Stephanie Elliott

The Medical Journal of Australia (MJA) is published on the 1st and 3rd Monday of each month by the Australasian Medical Publishing Company Proprietary Limited, Level 2, 26-32 Pyrmont Bridge Rd, Pyrmont, NSW 2009. ABN 20 000 005 854. Telephone: (02) 9562 6666. Fax: (02) 9562 6699. E-mail: ampco@ampco.com.au. The Journal is printed by Offset Alpine Printing Ltd, 42 Boorea St, Lidcombe, NSW 2141.

MJA on the Internet: <http://www.mja.com.au/>

None of the Australasian Medical Publishing Company Proprietary Limited, ABN 20 000 005 854, the Australian Medical Association Limited, or any of its servants and agents will have any liability in any way arising from information or advice that is contained in *The Medical Journal of Australia (MJA)*. The statements or opinions that are expressed in the Journal reflect the views of the authors and do not represent the official policy of the Australian Medical Association unless this is so stated. Although all accepted advertising material is expected to conform to ethical and legal standards, such acceptance does not imply endorsement by the Journal.

All literary matter in the Journal is covered by copyright, and must not be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form by electronic or mechanical means, photocopying, or recording, without written permission.

Published in 2 volumes per year.

Annual Subscription Rates for 2002 (Payable in Advance) to:

AMPCo, Locked Bag 3030, Strawberry Hills, NSW 2012

Individual Subscriptions (includes 10% GST)

Australia - \$A284.90, Medical students (Australia only) - \$A55.00

Overseas Economy Air - \$A396.00, Airmail - \$A539.00

NZ & PNG Economy Air - \$A363.00, Airmail - \$A490.00

Indexes are published every 6 months and are available on request as part of the current subscription.

Single or back issues contact: AMPCo (02) 9562 6666.

Advice to Authors — <http://www.mja.com.au/public/information/instruct.html>



27,459 circulation as at  
30 September, 2001



ISSN 0025-729X